

No.	First Name	Last Name	Title	Organization	Section	Sec. Page	Appendix	Appendix Page	Comment	Staff Response
1	David	Schonbrunn	President	TRANSDEF	1	6	--	--	P. 6: Call out how 65072 mandates that the CTP's policies and objectives be consistent with the legislative intent described in newly added climate policy §14000.6. It would be appropriate to emphasize just how significant a change this section brings to state transportation policy. TRANSDEF suggests the following language: "The mandate to reduce GHG emissions has highly significant implications for transportation policy. Achieving emissions reduction targets while simultaneously reducing traffic congestion will require a reduction in statewide VMT. This necessarily implies a revolution from the practices of the past in transportation and land use planning." If the text of the CTP was organized around this objective, rather than the more-generic six goals, it would certainly help readers recognize the centrality of VMT reduction to the attainment of all the goals.	Noted
2	David	Schonbrunn	President	TRANSDEF	3	17	--	--	P. 17: List the specific policy mandates set by the cited Government Code sections.	Accepted
3	David	Schonbrunn	President	TRANSDEF	--	--	B	50	P. 50: The checklist question "Does the CTP include a policy element?" is inadequate and inconsistent with the legislative mandate. Replace it with "Is the CTP's policy element consistent with the items in the following list of legislative intentions?" Append to that question a listing of all the intentions specified in the four cited code sections. Include a check box for each intention.	Partially Accepted
4	David	Schonbrunn	President	TRANSDEF	--	--	B	50	P. 50: Similarly, the checklist question "Does the CTP include a recommendation element?" is also inadequate and inconsistent with the legislative mandate. Replace it with "Does the CTP's recommendation element include economic forecasts?" and "Does the CTP's recommendation element achieve its performance objectives?"	Partially Accepted
5	David	Schonbrunn	President	TRANSDEF	--	--	B	51	P. 51: Given the degree of confusion, disagreement and obfuscation surrounding the recent use of the verb "to address," it would be highly desirable to provide guidance here as to the preferred interpretation. In the context of § 65072.2, TRANSDEF suggests the following: "Does the CTP provide a plan for how the state will achieve statewide GHG emissions reductions to 1990 levels by 2020, and 80 percent below 1990 levels by 2050, taking into consideration the use of alternative fuels, new vehicle technology, tailpipe emissions reductions, and expansion of public transit, commuter rail, intercity rail, bicycling, and walking." The CTP, after all, is a plan. It would be entirely consistent with the legislative authority in § 14000.6(d) to call for the CTP to plan to achieve the specified legislative intentions.	Noted
6	David	Schonbrunn	President	TRANSDEF	--	--	B	51	P. 51: The checklist question for § 65073.1 does not accurately convey the mandate. It should be: "Did the CTC review the recommendations in the draft CTP and submit its report of recommendations to the Legislature and Governor?"	Noted
7	Stuart	Mori	Senior Transportation Planner	High Speed Rail Authority	1	1			Federal and State Requirements, page 1. Consider adding (AB) after Assembly Bill and (SB) after Senate Bill. These abbreviations will then be understood thereafter, especially in the figures	Accepted
8	Stuart	Mori	Senior Transportation Planner	High Speed Rail Authority	1	2			CTP and Regional Transportation Plans, page 2. Consider adding commas after RTPs and after (RTPAs).	Rejected
9	Stuart	Mori	Senior Transportation Planner	High Speed Rail Authority	1	2			Next paragraph, page 2. Consider using a different word than "plethora," perhaps, several.	Rejected
10	Stuart	Mori	Senior Transportation Planner	High Speed Rail Authority	3	11			Section 3 CTP Element Development, page 22 Other Statewide Plans Consider changing to--(California High-Speed Rail Authority [Authority])	Accepted

No.	First Name	Last Name	Title	Organization	Section	Sec. Page	Appendix	Appendix Page	Comment	Staff Response
11	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	Multiple	2,3,22,23			Pages 2, 3, 22, and 23 plan contents: clarify relationships between statewide plans vs. regional plans?	Noted
12	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	-	-			RTP Modeling: is there a rubric used to establish modeling standards used by MPOs?	Noted
13	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	1	4			Page 4 matrix Area heading: are there guidelines needed to provide specifics of regional context (rural vs. urban, coast land vs. inland) and the fact California's MPOs/RTPs are different.	Noted
14	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	3	24			Page 24 Modeling Methods item a): provide technical notes to include bibliography. Also see item g): provide adequate technical note	Noted
15	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	-	-			Scenario Development: provide assumptions and modeling standards (technical notes could be used.)	Noted
16	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	3	25			Economic Forecast and Analyses page 25 provide technical criteria for economic modeling at statewide level	Noted
17	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	3	26-27			Implementation Element page 26 and matrix page 27: define entities responsible for implementation and governance hierarchy.	Noted
18	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	3	27-28			Monitoring and tracking page 27 and 28 particularly item e.: provide a realistic timeline consistent with the process of CTP document development, review and adoption.	Noted
19	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	4	29			Coordination and Engagement page 29: Outreach efforts need to be consistent with California's socio-demographic representative of most representative regions. Ensure adequate resources.	Noted
20	Fernando	Castro	Associate Transportation Planner	Caltrans District 7	-	-	A		Appendix A: Cal ARB or local air districts page 38: should address legislation tying CTP to Cal ARB and air districts. Address technical guidance for controlled measures. Do the same for the use of evolving technologies.	Noted
21	Kelly	Kerber		Air Resources Board	3	23			Add in the suggested ARB plans from our 8/30 comments to the list of Other Statewide Plans (pg. 23). At the least, it is important to add the State Implementation Plan and Mobile Source Strategy.	Accepted
22	Kelly	Kerber		Air Resources Board	3	24			Add the following language to bullet "f" under Modeling Methods (pg. 24): "... Suggest using modeling years in 10 year increments between 2020 and 2050. Of those increments, 2030 and 2050 are the most critical in order to align with existing statute." This language is to reflect the approach Brian Annis pitched during the 8/25 meeting. We feel this will be beneficial during recommendations and implementation development and will help to set general timeframes for actions. If you do not want to specify analysis years, there should at least be direction in the guidelines to have an interim modeling year.	Accepted
23	Kelly	Kerber		Air Resources Board	3	23			Consider specifying the use of feedback mechanisms in the Modeling Methods section. This is some suggested language: "A critical component of this modeling process is the feedback mechanism from one component to another. The interaction among key components improves the confidence in modeling results." Because this is an essential piece to the modeling process it is important to specify it in the guidelines. We understand this might be difficult to include so we appreciate your further consideration.	Noted